#### Introduction

### The Practice of Christianity in Byzantium

### Derek Krueger

In sixth-century Palestine, a circle of women gathered to weave curtains for two monasteries in the Judean desert. In the seventh century, a merchant from the island of Chios spent three months living and sleeping at the shrine of Saint Artemios in Constantinople waiting for the saint to heal his hernia. In eighth-century Constantinople, young mothers routinely adorned their babies with amulets to protect them from demons. In the twelfth century, in a small church in the Peloponnese, villagers attended liturgical services surrounded by life-size images of the saints; in another church, in the mountains of Cyprus, colorful scenes of major events in the lives of Christ and the Virgin, painted throughout the church, enveloped congregants in the world of the Bible. In fifteenth-century Thessalonica, mourners marked the third, ninth, and fortieth day after a family member's death by bringing offerings of boiled wheat with nuts and raisins to the parish church. Such acts shaped lay Christianity in Byzantium.

This volume of *A People's History of Christianity*, dedicated to Byzantine Christianity, explores the practices of lay Christians during the eleven centuries between the foundation of the city of Constantinople in 324 and its fall to the Ottoman Turks in 1453. Lasting from late antiquity to the threshold of the early modern period, the Byzantine Empire began as the eastern half of the Roman Empire and ended as a small medieval state. In the intervening centuries, Byzantine Christianity developed as a distinct system of religious practice and devotion, different from the medieval Roman

Catholicism emerging simultaneously farther west. While some doctrinal issues divided the Orthodox East and the Catholic West, most differences stemmed from cultural practices. Different ways of performing Christianity produced separate identities for these two groups of medieval Christians. Even as their empire shrank, Byzantine emperors and churchmen exported their Eastern Orthodoxy to neighboring peoples. The direct heirs of Byzantine Christianity remain numerous among Greeks, Slavs, Arabs, and others to this day. Today there are more than 200 million Orthodox Christians worldwide.

This volume introduces the religion of the Byzantine Christian laity by asking the question, "What did Byzantine Christians do?" To answer, we must consider how people prayed and how often they attended services; how they celebrated, married, and mourned; how they interacted with priests, monks, nuns, and holy people; where they went on pilgrimage and why they visited shrines; how they transmitted religious values to their children; and how they performed acts of charity. Indeed, questions about what ordinary Christians did in church or in their homes or workshops, about their veneration of saints or their use of icons, about their visual and material culture, and the place of religion in the course of their lives illuminate a people's Christianity. [fig 1.1 goes near here]

Many western readers tend, not surprisingly, to know less about Orthodoxy than about Catholic and Protestant forms of Christianity. And while Byzantine sources offer fairly detailed and accessible documentation for the religious lives of Byzantine aristocrats, clergy, and monastics, the piety of ordinary Christians and the patterns of their religious lives remains less familiar even to scholars. Researching the lives of ordinary Byzantines can be difficult. Most written sources derive from powerful church

leaders who used their texts to shape proper practice rather than leave behind an unbiased and unfiltered description of what people did. Yet careful interpretation of sermons, saints' lives, hymns, canon law, and histories, together with architecture, icons, church decoration, and small devotional objects enables a rich description of lay religion among non-elites. Drawing on the techniques of social and cultural history, the essays in this volume contribute to a historical anthropology of Byzantine Christianity.

The focus on religious practice complements and sometimes challenges other ways of telling the history of Christianity in Byzantium. Neither the history of Christian doctrine nor the institutional history of the Byzantine church is sufficient in itself to tell the story of Byzantine religious life. Townsfolk and tradesmen, women and children, village peasants, the poor and the powerless rarely feature as agents in these narratives. The history of popular religious practice affords perspectives on religion in their everyday lives. Moreover, the interest in practice rather than doctrine draws on recent insights within the modern academic study of religion. Scholars increasingly understand religions not simply as the assent to a series of intellectual propositions but rather as richly embodied cultural systems. To understand people's religious lives, we must explore their customs and habits. Only in this way can we begin to understand the logic that grounded Byzantine piety, the basic assumptions that made such widespread practices as visiting the saints or worshiping before icons a matter of common sense.

While Orthodox theology investigated ways to understand God and creation, humanity's participation in Christ's work of redemption, and how the divine might be present in images, much Byzantine religious activity sought solutions to practical problems. Christianity offered therapies for physical ailments, protection from illness

and demons, and the salvation of the soul after death. Observing pious activity uncovers patterns of Christian devotion both public and private. Festivals and vigils afforded opportunities for collective expressions of devotion to Christ and the saints, often standardized through hymns and liturgies. Christians performed their piety, engaging in behavior to be witnessed, either by other worshippers, or by the saints, or perhaps only by God and the self. Modern scholars have little access to the interior religious life of individual persons, but we can begin to reconstruct collective practice. Depending on the era, forms of private devotion—such as wearing small cross-shaped reliquaries, collecting and saving holy oil, or kissing icons—were often consistent across the broader population. Even intimate acts displayed common modes of self-presentation and comportment before the holy. To provide *A People's History* of Byzantine Christianity, this volume investigates a wide variety of religious expressions as they developed and changed over time.

# [A] Christianity in Byzantine History

Modern scholars divide Byzantine history into four periods, marking distinct phases in the territorial expansion and contraction of the empire, together with distinct forms of political and military organization, social and economic structure, and cultural and religious life.

The period from 324 to 641, early Byzantium, overlaps with the later Roman Empire, and maintained many continuities with antiquity. At its height, under Justinian, who reigned from 527 to 565, the empire stretched from the Eastern Mediterranean to include North Africa, the Italian Peninsula, and southern Spain. This multicultural,

multiethnic, and multireligious empire boasted the great cities of Constantinople and Alexandria, with as many as half a million inhabitants each; other large cities such as Antioch and Ephesus, with roughly 120,000 inhabitants; and numerous smaller cities, especially in Asia Minor and Syria, with 10,000 to 25,000 inhabitants. Despite the vitality of urban life, the vast majority of Byzantines lived on farms and in villages in rural districts. This period also saw the formation of an imperial Christianity, distinctive of Byzantium, where the emperor had effective control over the church, convening councils and appointing patriarchs and prominent bishops. Church leaders articulated Christian teachings on the incarnation and the Trinity under imperial guidance, although the supposedly definitive articulations of the faith at Nicaea (325), Chalcedon (451), and Constantinople (553) tended to perpetuate division as well as unity. Moreover, not all the empire's inhabitants were Christians. Jew remained an integral of Byzantine society throughout its history, and traditional polytheists (or "pagans") survived in locally significant populations into the sixth century, despite imperial edicts expropriating temples and restricting public practice.

Byzantine society and economy suffered decline in the century after the 540s as recurrent plague, disastrous earthquakes, wars with Persia, and the rise of Islam took their toll. The loss of the Levant and the southern Mediterranean to the Arabs in the 630s and 640s marks the beginning of the Byzantine "Dark Ages," 641-843. The population in the remaining lands in Asia Minor, Greece, and the Balkans was primarily Greek-speaking and Orthodox, although there were significant numbers of Slavs, Armenians, and Jews. With coastal cities in decline and a collapse in trade and coinage, Byzantine high culture nearly disappeared. Many people retreated to walled fortresses, or *kastra*, built on hills

and promontories for safety. While earlier Byzantine Christians had decorated churches and religious paraphernalia with images of Christ and the saints, the characteristic Orthodox veneration of icons appears to have emerged for the first time in this period, together with a violent reaction to icon piety known as iconoclasm. From 717-787, and again from 815-843, imperial policy condemned worship before images even as the practice spread among monastics and laity alike.<sup>3</sup>

The middle Byzantine period, lasting from 843 to 1204, saw the revival of the Byzantine state and successive centuries of flourishing culture. Although cities never regained the central status that they had achieved in late antiquity, they regularly expanded beyond their walled fortifications. New forms of church architecture and decoration spread quickly throughout the empire together with new forms of liturgy. The cultural embrace of icons meant that the interiors of even the simplest churches were covered with images of the saints and scenes from the life of Christ. During the reign of Basil II (976-1025), church authorities in Constantinople standardized the calendar of the saints and rewrote their *vitae*, or biographies, into versions short enough to read during morning prayer. The liturgy of the Great Church of Hagia Sophia disseminated from Constantinople to provincial churches. In the 860s began the first of many missions to convert the Slavs to Byzantine Orthodoxy, a development with momentous consequences for the peoples of Eastern Europe, especially the Bulgarians, Serbs, and Russians. By the end of the period, the empire's population included some Muslims.

Beginning already in the ninth century, the Byzantine church found itself in conflict with Rome over such issues as the text of the Nicene Creed and papal supremacy.

The Orthodox objected to the Latin addition of the *filioque* to the creed, the assertion that

the Holy Spirit proceeded not only from the Father, but from both the Father "and the Son." And while the Patriarch of Constantinople recognized his counterpart in Rome as a "first among equals," Byzantines rejected the claim that the pope was the sovereign of the entire Church. Perhaps more important for the self-understanding of ordinary Christians, Byzantines began to distinguish their practices from what they regarded as Latin aberrations, including priestly celibacy, crossing oneself backwards, and using unleavened bread at the Eucharist. Despite the mutual anathemas that Western and Eastern church leaders pronounced against each other in 1054, the schism between Byzantine Orthodox and Roman Catholic Christians did not have a feel of finality until the thirteenth century; and even so, Byzantines and Latins were still attempting to heal the rift in the 1430s. The middle Byzantine period also saw the rise of western Christian crusades to wrest the eastern Mediterranean and the Holy Land from Islamic control; but during the Fourth Crusade, in 1204, Latins sacked the city of Constantinople, bringing a glorious period in Byzantine history to a decisive end. [fig 1.2 goes near here]

The final phase of Byzantine history, from the restoration of Byzantine rule in 1261 to the fall of Constantinople in 1453, witnessed a dramatic revival under the dynasty of the Palaiologos family. This development is perhaps odd, given that the empire was little more than a rump state encompassing the regions of Constantinople, Thessalonica, and parts of the Peloponnese. Palaiologan elites commissioned beautiful churches, rich in mosaic and fresco, while on the peninsula of Mount Athos and elsewhere, Byzantine monasticism experienced a golden age. At the same time, lay practice coalesced in forms that would survive the centuries of Turkish rule to come.

# [A] Defining Byzantine Christianity

"Byzantine Christianity" is not quite the same things as "Christianity in Byzantium." First, there is the problem of self-designation. The Byzantines understood themselves to be Romans (Rhomaioi); they did not refer to themselves as Greeks (Hellenes) before the thirteenth century. Their empire was the Roman Empire, and Constantinople was the New Rome, founded on the site of the earlier town of Byzantion. Only after Constantinople's fall did sixteenth-century Western humanists begin to refer to the Eastern Roman state as "the Byzantine Empire." In some sense, Byzantine Christianity here could be understood as the medieval phases of Roman Orthodoxy, and indeed Arabic speakers still refer to those in communion with the Patriarch of Constantinople as "Rum Orthodox."

Then there are the problems of geographical and temporal scope. Byzantine Christianity is not a phenomenon coterminous with the shifting boundaries and temporal limits of a medieval state. This volume focuses on piety and devotional practice among Christians in the Eastern Mediterranean, and particularly the Northeastern Mediterranean, in the regions that are now Turkey, Greece, the Balkans, and Syria, Israel, and Palestine. But, not all of the Christians in this region were (or are) in communion with Constantinople. The communities that would emerge as the Syrian Orthodox, Coptic (or Egyptian) Orthodox, and Armenian churches were distinct in doctrine and organization. These groups, which split decisively with Byzantine Orthodoxy and the Patriarch of Constantinople in the course of the sixth century, due in part to the controversies following the Council of Chalcedon (451), lie beyond the scope of this volume. Even so, and despite different conceptions of the relationship between the human and the

divine in the person of Christ and allegiances to separate—and often competing—hierarchies, these Christians often shared the everyday practices typical in Byzantium, even when these communities found themselves beyond the bounds of Byzantine political control.

After the rise of Islam in the Eastern Mediterranean, many Greek Orthodox Christians in Syria and Palestine, under the patriarchates of Antioch and Jerusalem respectively, continued their allegiance to the Byzantine church, even as they began increasingly to speak Arabic. Moreover, through diplomacy and missionary work, the Byzantines exported their imperial orthodoxy northward, beyond the bounds of their empire, among various Slavic peoples, including Bulgarians, Serbs, Ukrainians, and Russians. For the most part, and regrettably, these Arabic- and Slavic-speaking Christians fall beyond the scope of these essays.

Byzantine Christianity also outlasted Byzantium. As parts of Eastern Anatolia fell to Seljuk Turks from the eleventh century and the rest of Anatolia and the Balkans to the Ottoman Turks in the fourteenth and fifteenth centuries, more and more Byzantine Christians found themselves practicing Christianity beyond the bounds of the imperial territories. Even after the Fall of Constantinople in 1453, Christians in former Byzantine lands continued to practice Christianity in many of the same ways, engaging in similar practices at home, in church, and throughout the course of their lives. Greek Orthodoxy today is both an heir of Byzantine Christianity and the product of a long encounter with modernity that began in the seventeenth century and endures into the present. This volume's focus on Christianity in Byzantium tells only part of Byzantine Christianity's story.

# [A] The People's Religion?

The quest for the people's Christianity in Byzantium implies, at least in part, that the religion of the common people differed from that of political and ecclesiastical authorities and religious specialists. And yet the religious lives of the elites and of the masses were not truly distinct. Rather, all Byzantine Christians participated in a shared system of religious practice, even as they experienced and took on different roles.

Many forms of piety spread throughout the social ranks. For example, one important locus of Byzantine piety was the healing shrine. The tombs of saints and repositories of their relics dotted major cities such as Constantinople and Thessalonica and were scattered throughout the Eastern Mediterranean basin. Suppliants came to these shrines in search of relief from a wide variety of ailments, applying salves of holy oil and wax to their afflicted parts, or ingesting infusions of water and holy dust. Some of the sick would sleep at the shrine, hoping that the saints would appear to them in a vision. The same saints would also appear to suppliants sleeping in their own beds. While modern scholars have often regarded such behavior as "popular religion," and earlier scholars might have thought of this as "folk religion," such labels are misleading. Byzantines at all social levels engaged in such practices, from peasants to members of the imperial family. According to the sixth-century historian Procopius of Caesarea, Saints Cosmas and Damian appeared to the emperor Justinian in a vision when he was gravely ill (On the Buildings 1.6.5-8). The difference between the emperor and the average lay person, of course, was that after the cure, Justinian had the means to entirely remodel the Church of Cosmas and Damian just up the Golden Horn from the capital (at modern

Eyüp) as a token of his gratitude. But humbler Christians shared the impulse to adorn the shrines of the saints with votive offerings.

The religious lives and outlooks of the lower ranks of the clergy, in particular, may not have differed so greatly from those of their lay parishioners. Even as they presided over the liturgy, administered sacraments, and offered spiritual guidance, ordinary priests, together with deacons and subdeacons, were usually longstanding residents of the communities they served. Unlike their Western counterparts, Byzantine priests could marry and raise families. In rural districts, the priest often farmed his plots alongside his fellow villagers. Some priests were dependent peasants on large estates.

And while the rhythms of monastic life shaped monks and nuns differently from lay people, it would be a mistake to overemphasize the differences between monks and the laity. Byzantine monasticism tended to be less institutional and hierarchical than its western counterparts; in the absence of a standardized Rule, such as the *Rule of Saint Benedict*, or of centralized systems of interrelated monasteries, as in the Cistercian movement, monasteries remained in a dynamic relationship with the lay world from which their members were drawn. In many cases, wealthy lay patrons founded monastic communities, and often members of the family would join these monasteries and govern them. Although, from the late tenth century on, monks might retire to the remoter wilderness of Mount Athos in increasing numbers, many monasteries were situated within the walls of cities and towns, or on their edges. Here the laity might go for counsel or healing; here they might easily join. Indeed, the twelfth-century, poet and historian John Tzetzes sneered that "every disgusting and thrice-accursed wretch has only to put on a monastic habit...dress himself up to look self-effacing in an ostentatious and

highly theatrical way...[and] immediately the city of Constantinople showers him with honors."<sup>5</sup> Such comments reveal an uneasy tension with monasticism, but also its abiding presence.

The influence of monastic life on ordinary Christians was enormous. Church authorities sought to shape lay observance in the image of monasticism. Already in the fourth century, in Easter letters to communities of Christians up and down the Nile, Athanasius of Alexandria called on lay Christians to spend Lent "imitating the behavior of the saints," cultivating self-control through prayers and vigils, the renunciation of sex, and fasting. An elaborate system, completely in place by the eleventh century, prescribed fasts for forty days before Christmas and seven weeks before Easter, for a variable period after Pentecost, for the first two weeks of August, during vigils preceding communion, in advance of various minor feasts, and on Wednesdays and Fridays. Some fasts forbade only meat, others meat and cheese, and some, such as the Easter vigil, demanded total abstinence from all food and drink. The rules demanded that while fasting, lay Christians also avoid sexual relations. Thus all Christians were called to periods of rigorous, semi-monastic observance: monks and nuns provided the model for a form of lay life that was particularly ascetic in character.

Even the distinction that obtained in the early Byzantine period between the cathedral and parish liturgies, on the one hand, and monastic liturgies on the other, disappeared after the ninth century, as monastic leaders imposed their offices on lay parishes. And yet, while the laity came to observe the monastic rites, the boundaries between parishioners and their clergy during services increased. In the early-Byzantine period, the urban laity participated in stational liturgies that processed through city

neighborhoods between major churches and shrines and rendered the entire city a ritual space. By the eighth century, the outdoor processional liturgies had come to an end, and most religious activity moved indoors. Processions still took place within the church building, but with less active lay participation. In the Little Entrance, during the first half of the liturgy, the laity sang psalms and hymns while the deacons and priests processed with the Gospel book. In the offertory or Great Entrance, the laity watched as deacons and priests brought eucharistic gifts from the nave to the altar. Especially in the sixth and seventh centuries, lay Christians participated in elaborate vigils on the eves of feasts, listening to readings and sermons and singing hymns. Over time, church architecture changed to mark a stronger boundary between laity and clergy. Toward the end of the middle Byzantine period and increasingly in the late Byzantine period, the low barrier, or templon, separating the laity in the nave from the clergy in the sanctuary around the altar, grew in height to become a wall covered with images of Christ and the saints, an iconostasis. Services became less participatory. Lay Christians could no longer see the priest during much of the service. Churches became smaller; the number of private chapels increased. What had once been a public service was increasingly private and screened from view.

Yet even the later Byzantine tendency to separate clergy from laity in liturgical settings does not change the fact that lay people shared—and shared in—many practices with clergy and monks. Moreover, the laity included most members of the upper classes. Therefore, an interest in lay Christianity does not, and cannot, exclude insights into elite modes of worship and observance. Indeed, lay piety is a useful lens through which to understand the common religion of most Byzantines, regardless of their class or status.

Supplementing and broadening other ways of doing church history, this project explores a common history from another vantage point.

# [A] The Ritual Markers of Byzantine Christianity

The essays in this volume look for Byzantine Christianity by observing its outward signs. One place to watch for this Christianity is in and around the parish church. Although in late antiquity, most Christians received baptism in adulthood, by the late sixth century, nearly all Byzantine Christians were baptized in infancy. And although the baptized received communion at least weekly in the earlier church and at every Eucharist that they attended, by the late fourth century, the frequency of communion began to decline, in correlation with a high theology of the sacraments. By the middle Byzantine period, most lay Christians received communion only a few times a year, on the Great Feasts appointed by the liturgical calendar, and especially at Easter. The sacramental liturgies thus provide too narrow a picture of lay religious life.

Preaching offers a different sort of evidence. In literary sources, church elites tended to present images of the laity as profoundly pious. Indeed they sought to influence the collective imagination so that Byzantines would conceive of themselves as a pious people. But as Jaclyn Maxwell and Vasiliki Limberis show, a preacher's conception of appropriate religious activities often conflicted with his congregant's ideas about how to behave in church, at shrines, and in the home. Maxwell listens carefully to sermons that John Chrysostom preached in fourth-century Antioch to hear the preacher's attempts to change ingrained modes of lay Christian behavior while making concessions about habits so widespread that no condemnation, however eloquent, could alter.

Limberis attends the roughly contemporary orations that the Cappadocian Fathers delivered at festivals of the martyrs to hear the creation of new and local forms of piety. Not only does she discover a negotiation between enthusiastic throngs and the bishops who sought to restrain them, she charts how aristocratic families presented themselves to their dependents as models for emulation.

Much of the excitement in collective religious activity took place beyond the bounds of the Divine Liturgy, the Eucharistic service of the church. Georgia Frank visits the night vigil in sixth-century Constantinople where a crowd gathered to hear a dazzling poet and cantor named Romanos bring the Bible to life on the eve of major festivals. During the course of a year, those in attendance entered the story of Judas's betrayal and Peter's fecklessness; they stood with the apostles at Christ's ascension. Like Limberis, James Skedros investigates the shrines and festivals of the saints to discover a mix of public celebration and private devotion. With a view spanning much of Byzantine history, he follows pilgrims to the shrines of Saint Demetrius in Thessalonica, Saint Menas outside of Alexandria, to the pillar of Saint Lazarus of Mount Gelasion, and to the Holy Land, watching devotees collect portable "blessings" in simple material substances: oil, water, and dust.

Closer to home, the local church still set the stage for the ritual action at the core of Byzantine observance. Sharon Gerstel visits churches in small country parishes from middle and late Byzantium, surveying architecture and decoration for clues about how villagers used their sacred spaces: how they entered and exited, where they stood, and what they saw. A simple structure, filled with icons, chanting, and incense, became the image of heaven on earth. Here too Byzantine Christians marked key moments in their

lives: baptism, possible marriage, and death. Nicholas Constas considers this last rite in detail, providing a broad history of dying, death, and mourning in Byzantium. Along the way he articulates Byzantine notions of the afterlife, of rewards and punishments, and the world to come.

The veneration of icons sets Orthodoxy apart from all other forms of Christianity. While Byzantine theologians contributed treatises to explain and defend the practice, the question of what ordinary Byzantines expected might happen when they addressed prayers to a saint though his image is harder to answer. Charles Barber turns to monastic evidence for clues about what Byzantines thought icons did in response to prayer and uncovers basic assumptions undergirding this practice. In another approach to Byzantine visual culture, Brigitte Pitarakis handles the small crosses and pendants that people wore around their necks. By reading the shapes and iconography of devotional objects, she traces their owners' private pieties as they expected protection, salvation, and divine assistance.

Religious practice was not uniform for all members of the laity. Indeed the religious lives of children and women differed from those of adult men. Peter Hatlie takes up the question of the formation of the young from the fourth to the ninth century, as boys and girls received religious instruction and filled their parents with anxiety and hope. Alice-Mary Talbot considers the religious lives of laywomen from the ninth to the fifteenth centuries: their worship at home and in the church; their interaction with priests, monks, and nuns; and their works of charity and largesse.

Histories of Christianity, usually centered on the West, often omit Byzantium or mention it only in passing. Many surveys of Christian doctrine abandon the Christianities of the East after the fifth-century Council of Chalcedon. Icons and iconoclasm feature as little more than a footnote, and the Great Schism justifies ignoring centuries in the development of Orthodoxy. Students of Byzantium know a different story, a rich cultural heritage bridging antiquity and the early modern. While the essays collected here cannot offer a comprehensive history of Byzantine Christian life and practice, they help to correct this imbalance, to reinscribe Byzantine Christians within in *A People's History of Christianity*.

# For further reading

- The Blackwell Dictionary of Eastern Christianity. Ed. Ken Parry, et al. Oxford: Blackwell, 1999.
- Cunningham, Mary. *Faith in the Byzantine World*. Downer's Grove, Ill.: Intervarsity Press, 2002.
- Meyendorff, John. *Byzantine Theology: Historical Trends and Doctrinal Themes*. New York: Fordham University Press, 2<sup>nd</sup> ed. 1979.
- The Oxford Dictionary of Byzantium. Ed. Alexander P. Kazdan and Alice-Mary Talbot. 3 vols. New York: Oxford University Press, 1991.
- *The Oxford History of Byzantium.* Ed. Cyril Mango. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2002.
- Safran, Linda, ed. *Heaven on Earth: Art and Church in Byzantium*. University Park, Penn.: Pennsylvania State University Press, 1998.

<sup>1</sup> Cyril of Scythopolis, *Life of Sabas* 80; *Miracles of Artemios* 5; Theodore of Studios, *Life of Theoktiste of Constantinople*, 884b-845a.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Symeon of Thessalonica, PG 155.688-89.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> For a reassessment of icon veneration and iconoclasm, see Leslie Brubaker, "Icons before Iconoclasm?," in *Morfologie sociale e culturali in Europa fra tarda antichità e alto Medioevo*, 2:1215-54 (Spoleto, 1998), and Leslie Brubaker and John F. Haldon, *Byzantium in the Iconoclast Era (ca. 680-850): A History*. Cambridge, Eng.: Cambridge University Press, 2003.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> For an excellent overview, see John Binns, *An Introduction to the Christian Orthodox Churches* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2002).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> Quoted in Paul Magdalino, "The Byzantine Holy Man in the Twelfth Century," in *The Byzantine Saint*, ed. Sergei Hackel (San Bernardino, Calif.: Borgo, 1983), 54. (refind\*\*\*)

<sup>6</sup> David Brakke, *Athanasius and the Politics of Ascetism* (Oxford: Clarendon, 1995), 182-198.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> Robert F. Taft, "The Frequency of the Eucharist throughout History," in *Beyond East and West: Problems in Liturgical Understanding*, 2<sup>nd</sup> ed. (Rome: Pontifical Oriental Institute, 1997), 87-110. Béatrice Caseau, "L'abandon de la communion dans la main (IVe – XIIe siècles)," *Travaux et mémoires* 14 (2002): 79-94.